

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Environmental Justice Analysis for Bayview-Hunters Point: Biosolids Digester Facilities Project and Community Benefits Program

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (USEPA) Office of Environmental Justice defines environmental justice as the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies. The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission's (SFPUC) Environmental Justice Policy affirms this definition as it applies to all of its operations, programs, and policies.

The report presents existing conditions related to a broad selection of potential environmental justice indicators for the community of Bayview-Hunters Point, followed by analysis of the potential adverse or beneficial effects of the Biosolids Digester Facilities Project (BDFP) as well as of the potential beneficial effects of SFPUC's Community Benefits Program on relevant indicators.

Chapter 1 presents the purpose of the report and introductions to the Sewer System Improvement Program (SSIP, of which the BDFP is a component), SFPUC's Environmental Justice Policy, its Community Benefits Policy and Program, and the Southeast Community Mitigation Agreement. Chapter 2 presents the regulatory setting and federal and state guidance on environmental justice analyses. Chapter 3 describes the socioeconomic setting for San Francisco as a whole and for the Bayview-Hunters Point neighborhood.

Chapter 4 presents existing conditions with respect to potential environmental justice indicators. It analyzes the community's minority and low-income status (the typical indicators used to identify a community where environmental justice may be a concern), and also presents a larger set of indicator types to better understand the existing environmental justice challenges facing the Bayview-Hunters Point community. Indicators are available from a variety of sources, depending on the geographic area and the environmental issue being analyzed. They can relate to pollution and environmental degradation, neighborhood infrastructure and the availability of services and community support, and demographics and health statistics, for example. In preparation for this report, SFPUC staff met with the Southeast Working Group and the SFPUC Citizens Advisory Committee Wastewater Subcommittee to gather input on potential indicators and existing sources of information. This report reflects the input of these groups.

The report presents information for each indicator on the conditions in Bayview-Hunters Point and the larger San Francisco area and draws a comparison between the neighborhood and the citywide context to determine whether conditions related to that indicator are disproportionately adverse in Bayview-Hunters Point. As shown in the table below, 33 of the 62 indicators studied in this report were found to be indicators of environmental justice concern for Bayview-Hunters Point, meaning that they indicate an existing disproportionate adverse condition in this neighborhood compared to San Francisco as a whole. Two – residential density and linguistic isolation – were found to be possible indicators, dependent on context.

In outreach to the community groups described above, SFPUC asked members to rank potential indicators by level of concern. Although no clear consensus was observable, the potential indicators that received the highest rankings were unemployment, poverty status, cost of living, educational attainment, diesel particulate matter (DPM) concentration, toxic releases from facilities, and groundwater threats. The following paragraphs address these in greater detail.

As indicated in the table below and expanded upon in the full report, Bayview-Hunters Point experiences double the citywide unemployment rate and more than double the citywide poverty rate, and has one of the lowest high school graduation rates among San Francisco neighborhoods, and each is considered an indicator of an existing disproportionate adverse condition. Several measures of the cost of living were reviewed as potential indicators. These include housing affordability, childcare costs, and proximity to goods and services. The report found that the rental affordability gap (difference between median income and median rental price), childcare burden, and proximity to healthy food retail and financial services were indicators of existing disproportionate adverse conditions related to the cost of living.

Review of available information indicated that DPM concentrations in Bayview-Hunters Point census tracts are below the citywide average, and therefore are not disproportionately high and adverse in this neighborhood. Similarly, several studies indicate that other neighborhoods experience a substantially higher burden from toxic releases from facilities than does the Bayview-Hunters Point neighborhood, and that the neighborhood is not disproportionately exposed to toxic releases from facilities. While the potential for groundwater contamination is considered disproportionately greater in Bayview-Hunters Point than citywide, groundwater is not used as a recognized or approved potable water source in Bayview-Hunters Point and thus groundwater threats were not considered an environmental justice indicator. However, conversations with community members have indicated that there are groundwater wells present in Bayview-Hunters Point for which no documentation is known to exist. SFPUC intends to research this issue during the preparation of the environmental review for SSIP projects.

The full report provides detail and sources of information for the indicators presented in the summary table. The existing conditions portion (Chapter 4) of the report is intended to serve as a baseline evaluation for the analysis of potential contributions of SFPUC's SSIP implementation to environmental justice impacts. It is also meant to indicate to SFPUC and community stakeholders where existing disproportionate adverse conditions exist in Bayview-Hunters Point that could

benefit from initiatives to avoid or eliminate disproportionate impacts of SFPUC decisions and activities, as directed by SFPUC's Community Benefits Policy.

Accordingly, in Chapters 5 and 6 of the report, SFPUC examines the potential adverse or beneficial effects of the Biosolids Digester Facilities Project (BDFP) as well as of the potential beneficial effects of SFPUC's Community Benefits Program on relevant indicators. Some indicators are more closely related to SFPUC activities and initiatives (e.g., nuisance odors from operation of the Southeast Plant) and some will have a less clear connection (e.g., academic performance).

Chapter 5 begins by screening the 33 indicators of environmental justice identified in Chapter 4 for their potential nexus to effects that would occur as a result of BDFP implementation. For all indicators that could be affected by the BDFP, a detailed analysis is presented to determine whether the BDFP would contribute to existing adverse conditions (e.g., by increasing toxic air contaminant emissions), benefit the neighborhood by improving upon existing conditions (e.g., by reducing nuisance odors), or have no effect on the indicator. The report makes several recommendations for measures that SFPUC should consider implementing to address potential environmental justice effects of the BDFP, as summarized below:

- Routinely monitor air pollutant emissions at the Southeast Plant
- Implement a PM2.5 offset program if monitoring indicates PM2.5 emissions exceed future emissions rates under the no-project alternative
- Expand the City's electric vehicle charging station network by installing publically accessible electric vehicle charging stations
- Require equipment and haul trucks to not park in or block the loading zone at the Wu Yee South East Development Center (daycare) during times when children are most likely to be outdoors
- Consider implementing dedicated bike lanes along Jerrold Avenue
- Ensure that replacement night lighting along Jerrold Avenue is consistent with the San Francisco Better Streets Plan
- Meet the spirit of the San Francisco Urban Forest Plan of replacing all removed trees at a minimum 1:1 ratio
- Provide public construction signage in both Spanish and Chinese

Chapter 6 begins by screening the 33 indicators from Chapter 4 for their potential nexus to SFPUC's Community Benefits Program. For all indicators that could be affected by the initiatives, activities, and investments under this program, analysis is presented to determine what potential effects may be and how SFPUC can best direct its investments in community benefits. The report makes several recommendations for measures that SFPUC can implement to improve environmental justice outcomes of the Community Benefits Program, as summarized below:

- Monitor ambient air quality at the new Southeast Community Facility and implement community based-programming to support monitoring

- Bring back the Bayview Garden Supply pop-ups program
- Ensure that Community Benefits grant programs supporting the planting and maintenance of trees and gardens target the neighborhood around BDFP sites
- Expand its electric vehicle charging station network by installing publically accessible electric vehicle charging stations at the new Southeast Community Facility
- Provide paid internships to 150 to 200 young people annually in Bayview-Hunters Point, continue to support the SSIP Job Training and Opportunities Program and the Business Opportunities Program to create job and small business contracting opportunities for Bayview-Hunters Point
- Incorporate opportunities for pedestrian and bicycle connections to the new Southeast Community Facility
- Double square footage of Southeast Community Facility childcare facility and number of children served
- Use future greenhouses, in part, for growing food
- After 5 years, review outcomes and progress related to the environmental justice indicators and the Community Benefits program actions and initiatives to assess and record progress on environmental justice indicators in Bayview-Hunters Point

SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE INDICATORS

Indicator Type	EJ Indicator	Notes Regarding Disproportionality
Ozone Concentrations		Citywide rates are all the same (and lowest statewide)
PM2.5 Concentrations	●	Percentage of people in an area with a PM2.5 concentration at or above 10 µg/m3 is 3.7 times the citywide percentage
DPM Concentrations		DPM concentrations below citywide average
Toxic Releases from Facilities		Rate of exposure to toxic releases is consistent with other tracts citywide
Cancer Risk from TACs	●	Percentage of people in an area with total cancer risk greater than 100 cases per 1 million people is 1.6 times the citywide percentage
Nuisance Odors	●	Nuisance odors are a known issue for this neighborhood
Traffic Density	●	Only an indicator for western census tracts near U.S. 101 and I-280
Truck Routes		Lower percentage of residents live near truck routes than citywide
Outdoor Noise Levels		Lower percentage of residents live in an area of high outdoor noise than citywide
Traffic-Related Injuries		Lower rates of injuries than citywide
Polluted Discharges / Impaired Water Bodies		Census tracts in proximity to Bay, Golden Gate, and Ocean all have high rates
Drinking Water Contamination		SFPUC water is some of the least contaminated in the state
Agricultural Pesticide Use		Data not available for or applicable to BV-HP
Presence of Cleanup / Brownfield Sites	●	While several neighborhoods have a higher concentration of sites, approximately one-third of all sites citywide are located in BV-HP
LUST Concentration		LUSTs are most associated with gas stations, evenly distributed throughout City
Hazardous Waste Generators / Facilities Proximity	●	Proximity score between 1.3 and 2.5 times the citywide average
Solid Waste Sites and Facilities Proximity	●	Highest concentration in BV-HP compared to all other neighborhoods
Groundwater Threats		Groundwater is not used as a potable supply in San Francisco
Zoning for Industrial Uses	●	More than half of all industrial-zoned land in City is in BV-HP
Affordability Gap: Homeownership		One of the lowest affordability gaps in the City
Affordability Gap: Rental	●	Among the highest affordability gaps in the City
Rent Burden		Citywide concern, with every neighborhood burdened
Percent of Housing Stock Affordable		BV-HP housing stock almost five times more affordable than citywide stock
Prevalence of At Risk Foreclosure	●	BV-HP foreclosure rate four times citywide average
Overcrowding		Less overcrowded than citywide, and several neighborhoods more overcrowded
Displacement	●	Percentage of BV-HP residents living in low-income tracts experiencing displacement is more than 35 percent greater than the city as a whole.
Housing Tenure		Higher homeownership rate in BV-HP than citywide
New Housing Construction		Not considered an indicator in and of itself
Housing Condition / Code Violations		Lower rate of Code violations than citywide
Residential Mobility		Similarly likely to move away as residents in City as a whole
Homelessness	●	Citywide homelessness concentrated in Districts 10 and 6
Residential Density	○	Most neighborhoods have a density at least double that of BV-HP
Motor Vehicle Access		Higher car ownership rate than citywide
Public Transit Ridership and Score	●	Less access to high-transit ridership streets than citywide
Bicycle Network	●	Limited bike lanes, especially given geographic size of neighborhood
Walkability	●	Most of San Francisco has low-to-moderate walkability, but walking is perceived as substantially less safe in BV-HP compared to other neighborhoods

SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE INDICATORS (Continued)

Indicator Type	EJ Indicator	Notes Regarding Disproportionality
Library Proximity		Similar proximity rate to citywide
Religious / Spiritual Density		Higher concentration of such facilities than citywide
Community Center Proximity		Similar concentration of such facilities citywide
Academic Performance of Schools	●	Some of the lowest test scores in the City
Recreational Area Score	●	Markedly lower score than citywide, although partially offset by other facilities
Open Space and Trees	●	Poor proximity and access to open space, among the lowest concentration of trees in the City
Child Care Availability		Performs less well than citywide, but not disproportionately so
Average Child Care Burden	●	Cost burden higher; higher percentage of children not receiving subsidies
Healthy Food Retail Proximity	●	Much lower proximity score than citywide
Financial Services Proximity	●	Much lower proximity score than citywide
Concentration of Alcohol Vendors		Lower concentration than citywide
Poverty: % Below Two Times Federal Poverty Level	●	Also indicated in standard and enhanced community screening
Unemployment	●	Double the citywide rate
Earned Income Tax Credit	●	Percentage of EITC filers in BV-HP is more than double citywide
Population of Children	●	Percentage of households with children more than double citywide
Population of Elderly		Lower percentage of elderly residents than citywide
Pre-Natal Care Rate	●	Worst pre-natal care rate in the City
Low Birth Weight	●	BV-HP census tracts among the highest rate of low-birth weight babies statewide
Asthma Hospitalization Rate	●	Rate is 3 times the citywide average
Preventable Hospitalizations / Emergency Room Visits	●	Rate is almost double the citywide average
Voter Turnout	●	Markedly lower than citywide participation rate
Educational Attainment	●	Rate of non-high school graduates almost double citywide rate
Linguistic Isolation	○	Only one BV-HP census tract ranks at or about 75th percentile citywide, but overall limited English proficiency population is greater than citywide
Violent Crime Rate	●	Double the citywide rate
Property Crime Rate		Close to the citywide rate
Community Resiliency to Climate Change	●	Ranked least resilient citywide, with five other neighborhoods
<p>Symbol Key: ● Means this is an indicator of environmental justice concern ○ Means this may be an indicator</p> <p>NOTE: Bayview-Hunters Point is abbreviated BV-HP in indicator tables throughout this section.</p>		